

MINUTES OF THE 33rd MEETING OF THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE OF BOARD OF GOVERNORS OF CENTRAL COUNCIL OF HOMOEOPATHY HELD ON 02.08.2019 AT NEW DELHI.

PRESENT

- | | | |
|-----------------------------|---|-------------|
| 1. Sh. Nilanjan Sanyal | - | Chairperson |
| 2. Dr. Anil Kumari Malhotra | - | Member |
| 3. Dr. Anil Khurana | - | Member |
| Dr. Kumar Vivekanand | - | Secretary |

Dr. D. Samba Murthy, Inspector and Shri Y.D. Vats, Asstt. Secretary (Admn.) were present to assist the Secretary during the meeting.

Agenda item No. 1

Confirmation of the Minutes of the 32nd meeting of the Executive Committee of Board of Governors held on 22.07.2019 at New Delhi.

The Executive Committee confirmed the Minutes of its 32nd meeting held on 22.07.2019 at New Delhi as circulated.

Agenda item No. 2

Action taken Report on the minutes of the 32nd meeting of Executive Committee of Board of Governors held on 22.07.2019 at New Delhi.

The Executive Committee noted the Action taken by the office of this Council on the Minutes of the 32nd meeting of Executive Committee of Board of Governors of Central Council of Homoeopathy held on 22.07.2019 at New Delhi.

Agenda item No. 3

Appointment of IT Consultant on contract basis.

Executive Committee noted the appointment of Shri Vishal Srivastava to the post of IT Consultant in the Council w.e.f. 24.07.2019 for a period of one year.

Agenda Item No.4

Weeding out/destruction of old record of Court Cases Files.

Executive Committee considered the office proposal of weeding out of old record of disposed off court cases up to 2012 with direction to retain the hard copy of court order/s.

Agenda Item No.5

Letters have been received from M.P. Council, Delhi Board, Gujarat Council, Rajasthan Board, U.P. Board, and Himachal Pradesh Council reg. removal of the names of the practitioners from their State Registers of Homoeopathy.

The Executive Committee agreed with the office proposal for removal of 49 names from the Central Register of Homoeopathy.

Agenda Item No.6

Ministry letter No. R.15012/60/2018-EP(II) dated 26.07.2019 in respect of application of the Chairman, Ayushmati Education and Social Society, to start a new Homoeopathic Medical College namely R.N. Kapoor Memorial Homoeopathic Hospital & Medical College, session 2019-20 under Section 12A of the HCC Act.

The Executive Committee noted the direction of Ministry of Ayush for issue of LOI to R.N. Kapoor Memorial Homoeopathic Hospital & Medical College and compliance there to by the office post facto. The Executive Committee directed the Secretary of the Council that before initiating action, he should seek directions of Chairperson and place the communication from the Ministry before him, which was not done in the present case. Such action by the Secretary on his own should not be repeated.

Agenda Item No.7

Ministry letter No.F.No.R.14014/200/2019-EP(II) of Ministry of AYUSH, dated 24.07.2019, regarding clarification of recommendation in respect intake capacity of Venkateshwara Homoeopathic Medical College, Chennai in compliance to W.P. no. of 16995/2019 and WMP nos 16557 and 16559 of 2019 dated 02.07.2019 at the High Court of Madras.

The Executive Committee considered the letter dated 24.07.2019 of Ministry of AYUSH, regarding clarification of recommendation in respect of intake capacity of Venkateshwara Homoeopathic Medical College, Chennai in compliance to W.P. no. of 16995/2019 and WMP nos 16557 and 16559 of 2019 dated 02.07.2019 at the High Court of Madras and discussed the matter threadbare.

The EC observed that the instant college was permitted by the then Council with intake capacity of 100 seats from 2002-2003 onwards. However, the college could make admissions of 50 students only till 2013 due to affiliation of concerned university for 50 seats only.

The EC also took cognizance of the orders of Hon'ble High Court of Madras which allowed admissions of 100 students from 2014-15 and quashed the GoI's orders to apply u/s 12A for its request for 100 seats in 2013 as well as the University's order limiting seats to 50 and since it was passed late in the Academic Year, the college had been admitting 100 students in 2014-15 and continued thereafter to admit 100 students on order of the High Court. This order of the High Court in 2014-15 and subsequent years to allow admission of 100 seats in 1st BHMS every year thereafter was inadvertently not taken on record by the Council, though no appeal had also been apparently filed against the High Court orders, which, therefore assumed finality. And due to this inadvertent situation, Council was inspecting and recommending for 50 UG seats to the Ministry despite its original 100 intake capacity which was not revoked beforehand.

By considering the above, the EC of CCH, decided to recommend for allowing admission in I-BHMS Course with the intake capacity of 100 seats in existing UG (BHMS) course for the current session (i.e. 2019-20) as the college is fulfilling the criteria as per HCC (MSR 2013) for 100 seats intake capacity.

Agenda Item No.8

Mail dated 18.06.2019, of Principal Dhanwantri Homoeopathic Medical College regarding permission for 75 UG seats instead of 50 seats.

The Executive Committee considered the mail dated 18.06.2019 of the Principal, Dhanwantri Homoeopathic Medical College regarding permission for 75 UG seats instead of 50 seats.

The EC observed that the instant college was permitted by the then Council with intake capacity of 75 seats from 2002-2003 onwards. However, the college could make admissions of 50 students only till 2008-09 due to affiliation of concerned university for 50 seats only. Due to this inadvertent situation, Council was inspecting and recommending for 50 UG seats to the Ministry despite its original 75 intake capacity which was not revoked beforehand.

The EC also took cognizance of the orders of Hon'ble High Court of Madras which allowed original intake capacity of CCH in similar cases quashing the GoI's orders to apply u/s 12A for its request to increase the intake capacity. The college is admitting 75 UG students since 2009-10 after the university permitted enhanced affiliation to 75 seats in 2009 on its own till 2015-16 and thereafter for 2017-18 & 2018-19, through the orders of Mumbai High Court. For 2016-17, the college had approached Delhi High Court to quash the order of Central Govt. to deny permission for admission of 50 students in I BHMS in 2016-17, but the petition was dismissed.

The Executive Committee further observed that, this Council vide its letter dated 07.07.2009 had asked the concerned Maharashtra University for affiliation status of Homoeopathic Medical Colleges for 2009-10 with University, to maintain the proper record and the University through its letter dated 09.09.2009 informed this Council that intake capacity of colleges was 50 and Council updated its list accordingly with intake capacity of other colleges. But, the University through its letter dated 28.10.2009 increased its intake capacity to 75 of its own with a copy to this Council which could not be updated as at that time power to increase intake capacity was with Central Government. Due to this inadvertent situation, Council was inspecting and recommending for 50 UG seats to the Ministry despite its original 75 intake capacity which was not revoked beforehand.

In this year 2019-20, the EC of CCH had similarly recommended for intake of 50 seats in I BHMS in respect of this college based on inspection report and Ministry also permitted intake of 50 seats. Subsequently, the college has filed Writ Petition No. 7416 of 2019 at Hon'ble High Court of Bombay and Court has passed orders directing the Central Council to depute an official of the Council to remain present with all original records and the Secretary and Inspector of Council have appeared before the Hon'ble Court of Bombay on 25.07.2019, and the Hon'ble High Court of Bombay was pleased to pass an order on 25.07.2019 directing that, ".....we do not accept the oral objection raised today to the maintainability of this petition. Let the Council file a detailed affidavit disclosing its stand, not only with regard to this objection raised today, but merits as well...." and Council is in process of filing the Counter Affidavit.

However, on getting representation for the college to allow intake of 75 seats, the EC of CCH, decided to re-inspect the college for 75 seats. The college got re-inspected on 11.07.2019 and EC of CCH, in its

meeting held on 02.08.2019, decided to recommend for not allowing admission in I BHMS Course for the session 2019-20, due to the gross deficiencies in OPD/IPD of the Hospital and other deficiencies reflected in the report of re-inspection. The EC felt that, as matter is subjudice, decision of EC may be considered after final outcome of the present writ in this regard. However, deficiencies reflected in the report of re-inspection are as under:

- 13 FT (02 Professor, 04 Reader, 07 Lecturer) teachers available against the requirement of 28.
- 03 Guest Faculty (02 Professor, 01 Reader) available against the requirement of 12.
- No Teaching staff were present in the department of Practice of Medicine.
- Out of 28 FT teachers - 09 teachers (01 GCEH (prof) 07 BHMS(2 Prof and 5 Readers) & 01 DHMS (Prof) are without MD qualification. No details regarding previous teaching experience & continuity of experience is mentioned
- Pathologist, Anesthetist, Gynecologist, Physician, Ophthalmologist, Pediatrician and Dentist are not available during the inspection.
- Dispensary for OPD & IPD not separate. Doctor duty room, Nursing station room not available
- Separate clinical laboratory for hospital available **but not functioning**.
- Operation theatre available **but not functioning**.
- Post-operative recovery room, space for sterilized linen, Surgeon room & Nursing staff room **not available**.
- Rehabilitations unit including yoga & physiotherapist **not available**.
- **Disorganized IPD & OPD seems to be non-functioning on regular basis.**
- Records not maintain properly (IPD, OPD, case sheets, ECG, X-ray, Clinical lab). Many empty pages in OPD register.
- Required Obstetrician/Gynecologist, Pathologist/Biochemist, House Physician, Nursing staff, Ward Boys/Ayas, Yoga Expert, Physiotherapist, Lab Attendant and Dark Room Attendant not available.
- Physiology & Biochemistry Lab Attendant and Pathology & Microbiology Lab Attendant not available. Library Assistant 1 available against the requirement of 2.
- Required no. of Stretcher with Trolley, Sterilizers, Artery Forceps, Back Rest, Diagnostic Set (ENT) 01 not available in hospital.
- Required no. of Haematocrit Tubes, Sphygmomanometer, DVD, Films, Slides and Audio Visual Aids, Facility for Animal Experiments demonstration with the help of Audio Visual Aids, Balance, chemical/ordinary, Centrifuge, pH meter not available in Physiology Dept. Biochemistry Lab is not established separately.
- No staffs were found available in the Department of Medicine during inspection hence Nothing was mentioned about the availability of items.
- Hydrometer and Filter Pasteur chamber land not available in Community Medicine Dept.
- Porcelain Dishes, Glass apparatus for filtration with vacuum, Botanical Slides, Models, species in herbal garden not available for Pharmacy Dept.
- Required Software not available in the Dept. of Repertory.

Agenda item No.9

Inspection u/s 12A of HCC Act, 1973 for starting New BHMS Course from the session 2019-20.

| Sl. No. | Name of the College | Purpose | Date of Inspection | Report Dispatched on | Report received in CCH on | Remarks |
|---------|---|--|--------------------|----------------------|---------------------------|---|
| 1. | State Homoeopathic Medical College & Hospital, Kasimpur Road, Chherat, Aligarh-202122, UP | For LoP to start new BHMS course with intake of 100 seat | 23.07.19 | 24.07.19 | 26.07.19 | <p>Recommended for not to issue Letter of Permission (LoP) to start new BHMS course for the session 2019-20 due to lack of higher faculty in Materia Medica, Organon of Medicine, Nil Guest faculties and ineligible (03) Readers in Anatomy, Organon of Medicine and Pharmacy Departments due to teaching experience other than the concerned subjects and other shortfalls as per inspection report. Deficiencies reflected in the report of inspection are as under:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• No Guest faculty available, Professor in Organon of Medicine not available, Professor and Reader in Materia Medica not available and Principal has BHMS qualification.• X-ray, ECG and USG Machine not available, MoU with Super-specialty Hospital of Modern Medicine with the College not available and Hospital Kitchen space available but not functional.• Senior Medical officer not available against 01, Medical officer 01 available against the requirement of 02.• Surgeon, Obs./Gynae. Pathologist/Biochemist is 01 available respectively but On Call, Laundry, Hospital catering not available, Medical record room staff not available, Dresser, X ray attendant, Nursing staff in charge, Nurses, (06) ward boys/ Aya, Registration Clerk all are reported as FT out sourcing.• Library assistant 01 available against the requirement of 02 and Sanitation Staff not reported.• Stretcher with trolley 02 available against 03, B.P. |

| | | | | | | |
|----|--|--|----------|----------|----------|---|
| | | | | | | <p>instrument 04 available against 05, Artery forceps, small and big 06available against 12, Oxygen cylinder with stand 02 available against 03 in hospital equipment.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1943 books against 2000 and Reading room for students and teaching faculty with capacity available but no chairs in Central Library. • Soft part Wet and Dry not available, Mummified bodies not available, Cadavers not available and College applied for Anatomy act in dept. of Anatomy. • Auto Analyer not available, Haemocytometer 04 available against 25, Stethographs or pneumographs not available against 05, Glass Distillation (double) apparatus not available against 01, Colour perception lantern (Etridge Green) not available against 01, Films and Audio Visual Aids not available, Perimeter not available against 03, Double distillation apparatus glass, Centrifuge, medium speed not available against 01respectively, Stove, Stands clamps and Flash not available and pH meter not available against 01 in dept. of Physiology. • Crucibles with tongs not available against 25, Macretor not available against 05, Distillation Apparatus (Glass) not available against 01, Chemical Balance not available against 10 and Models and Alcohol are not available, Alcohol/Spirit license is applied and No. of species planted not reported in dept. of Pharmacy. |
| 2. | State Homoeopathic Medical College & Hospital, Barhalganj, Gorakhpur, UP | For LoP to start new BHMS course with intake of 100 seat | 23.07.19 | 24.07.19 | 29.07.19 | Recommended for not to issue Letter of Permission (LoP) to start new BHMS course for the session 2019-20 due to lack of higher faculty in Materia Medica, Organon of Medicine, Anatomy, Physiology and Nil Guest faculty and other shortfalls as per inspection report. Deficiencies reflected in the report of |

| | | | | | |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| | | | | | <p>inspection are as under:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No higher faculty (Professor/Reader) available in Anatomy, Physiology, Materia Medica & Organon of Medicine Dept. • No Guest Faculty available. • MoU for Clinical Training of Students with Super-specialty Hospital of Modern Medicine not available. • Surgeon and Anaesthetist not available, required Ward Boy / Ayas is not available, Store Keeper not available against 01 and Lab Attendant, Dark Room Attendant not available. • The availability and non availability of items in hospital and teaching departments are not quantified but as per the annexure following items are deficit. • Stretcher with trolley 01 available against 03, B.P Instrument 10 available against 20, Artery forceps small and big 02 available against 12, Backrest 02 available against 06, Diagnostic set ENT 01 available against 03 and Chair trolley with wheels 01 available against 02 in Hospital equipment. • Total number of Books 511 against the requirement of 2000 and 01 Library Assistant available against the requirement of 02 in central library. • Mummified bodies, Latest diagrams and Cadavers not available, Storage tanks to hold cadavers not available and Microscope 20 available against 25 in Dept. of Anatomy. • Biochemistry department not reported in Dept. of Physiology. • Alcohol not available and Alcohol/Spirit license applied for permission and Homoeopathic Pharmacopoeias not available in Dept. of Pharmacy. • 10 Charts available on Medicine for Homoeopathic Materia Medica against 25 and |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|

| | | | | | | |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| | | | | | | <p>Picture wise presentation of drugs 05 available against 10 in Dept. of Materia Medica.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Photographs of Dr. C. Dunham, Dr. E. A. Farrington, Dr. E. B. Nash, Dr. R. E. Dudgeon, Dr. Mahendra Lal Sirkar, Babu Rajendra Lal Dutta not available in Dept. of Organon of Medicine. |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|

Agenda Item No.10.1

Mail dated 01.08.2019 of Shri P. K. Pathak, Addl. Secretary, M/o AYUSH and Member, BoG regarding eligibility of 04 teachers of Arogya Homoeopathic Medical College, Jaipur, Rajasthan.

The Executive Committee considered the mail dated 01.08.2019 of Shri P. K. Pathak, Addl. Secretary, M/o AYUSH and Member, BoG regarding reason for non-eligibility of 04 teachers of Arogya Homoeopathic Medical College, Jaipur, Rajasthan as recommended by CCH. The Executive Committee noted the decision taken during its 22nd meeting of the Executive Committee of Board of Governors held on 01.05.2019 and not recommending for allowing admissions in I-BHMS Course for the session 2019-20 due to shortfall in required eligible teachers based on MSR 2013. The committee discussed the matter again and observed that, all 04 teachers as per document provided by college & endorsed by visitors are not having essential PG qualifications. As per MSR 2013 for Homoeopathic colleges, PG has been made essential qualification for all teaching grades more so for lecturers appointed after March 2013. This college started in 2018 and has appointed these 04 teachers (01 Reader & 03 Lecturers) in March 2018 (after 2013). Moreover, the experience period shown in the submitted documents found to be overlapping with previous college, hence doubtful and could not be considered, as eligible.

Agenda Item No.10.2

Nomination of Dr. B. T. Rudresh, Member BOG.

The Executive Committee noted the Gazette Notification dated 31.07.2019 regarding nomination of Dr. B. T. Rudresh, as a Member BOG and asked the office to issue a formal letter of intimation to the member, welcoming him to the Board of Governors of the CCH.

The Executive Committee directed the office to complete the actions on the decisions in these minutes immediately, keeping in view of urgency of the matters.

Meeting ended with the vote of thanks to the Chair.

Attested

Sd/-

(Nilanjan Sanyal)
Chairperson

Sd/-
(Dr. Kumar Vivekanand)
Secretary